



RPM

Revista Portuguesa de Musicologia
Portuguese Journal of Musicology

Review: Graeme M. Boone (ed.), *Music in the Carolingian World: Witnesses to a Metadiscipline, Essays in Honor of Charles M. Atkinson* (Turnhout, Brepols, 2023), 455 pp., ISBN: 978-2-503-60330-8

Recensão: Graeme M. Boone (ed.), *Music in the Carolingian World: Witnesses to a Metadiscipline, Essays in Honor of Charles M. Atkinson* (Turnhout, Brepols, 2023), 455 pp., ISBN: 978-2-503-60330-8

Debra Lacoste | Dalhousie University

Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada

debra.lacoste@dal.ca | <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0485-2051>



<https://doi.org/10.57885/rpmns.522>



RPM

Revista Portuguesa de Musicologia
Portuguese Journal of Musicology

nova série | new series

11/1 (2024), pp. 131-136 | ISSN 2183-8410

doi: 10.57885/rpmns.522 | <http://rpm-ns.pt>

Review: Graeme M. Boone (ed.), *Music in the Carolingian World: Witnesses to a Metadiscipline, Essays in Honor of Charles M. Atkinson* (Turnhout, Brepols, 2023), 455 pp., ISBN: 978-2-503-60330-8

Debra Lacoste

Wonderfully dense and not for the faint of heart, *Music in the Carolingian World: Witnesses to a Metadiscipline* assembles an all-star slate of international scholars from a variety of fields, backgrounds, and career stages in a collection of essays devoted to music and its status as a subject of study in late antiquity through the early medieval period. In and of itself, the volume reflects the ‘meta’ of interactions and collaborations of great minds, perhaps a modern parallel to the gathering of scholars at the Carolingian court.

This book will appeal to a wide range of academic readers, from those interested in musicology and music theory, to historical sociology, the history of mathematics, pedagogy, philosophy, theology, liturgy, and the study of intellectual traditions. While it demonstrates that music broadly understood is a unifying force among the disciplines pursued and taught by Carolingian scholars, it may also serve university graduate seminars in medieval studies that attract students from different disciplinary backgrounds.

The essays in *Music in the Carolingian World: Witnesses to a Metadiscipline* stem from a conference held in 2011 that honored the career and musicological research of Charles M. Atkinson, a leading scholar in early medieval studies and the dedicatee of this publication. Atkinson’s introductory *Prolegomena* is particularly engaging, as he places in context the sequence of articles in the book while drawing on his experience from the 2011 conference, identifying the ‘larger role of music as a binding force in various spheres of activity’ (p. 20). Citations abound, both from early medieval authors and modern scholars, setting the tone for a well-referenced, high-calibre publication. Atkinson makes accessible the readings of original Latin texts by providing English translations (of the *Admonitio generalis*, for example, pp. 13 ff.)—thus modelling his experience interacting with students during years of university teaching—but also challenges his readers to deeper considerations of how music in the

Carolingian period could be both a medium of performance and the basis of intellectual pursuits that manifested in the routines of everyday life.

The *Preface* by editor Graeme M. Boone provides a helpful summary of the volume. It clearly outlines the conference themes that have been migrated to this published volume of papers: *Verbum*, relating to language; *Numerus*, relating to number; *Ars*, relating to formalized learning and practice; and *Cultus*, drawing on liturgical practices, texts, and melodies. Advertisements for the book boast of its seventeen essays which, by my count, incorporate twenty-one contributors, including the postscript to Michel Huglot's article by Barbara Haggh-Huglo and its appendices supplied by Barbara Shailor and Manuel Pedro Ferreira. The two conference keynotes (Patrick Geary and Calvin Bower) are supplemented in this published volume by Atkinson's *Prolegomena* (placed after Graeme Boone's *Preface*) which could be equated to a third keynote.

Essays relating to the conference theme 'Verbum' are presented first. Aligning with the importance of words and language, Jan Ziolkowski addresses the term 'metadiscipline' at the opening of his chapter. This is fitting for the first proper essay of the volume, and while he demonstrates the uptick in usage of the term through the early 2000s with a Google N-Gram analysis, in retrospect it seems ahead of its time for the conference from which these papers derive. Since 2011, the term 'metadiscipline' has become more mainstream as inter- and transdisciplinarity have been more fully explored. Now, fourteen years later, even the prefix 'meta' has become increasingly popular in social spheres as both a stand-alone slang catchword and the rebranded name of a social media company. Regardless, 'metadiscipline' aptly describes the intersections of music and texts in the curriculum during the Carolingian period which are explored by Ziolkowski using evidence of neumes added to poetry in extant copies of Virgil. Sam Barrett follows with a study and inventory of a variety of ninth-century texts in *Bern, Burgerbibliothek, 455* that reveal through various clues, including the format of their copying, that they were sung. In the next chapter, the imagery of king (heavenly or otherwise) is traced by Gunilla Iversen in early proses and tropes to the liturgy from the time of Charlemagne's children and grandchildren, where political messages were delivered in song through liturgical celebrations.

The relationship between music and the mathematical sciences has long been considered by philosophers, music theorists, physicists, and mathematicians, and more recently by computational musicologists, among others. This is the topic of the papers grouped within the 'Numerus' theme. Michel Huglot's article, translated and edited by Barbara Haggh-Huglo, is filled with diagrams, both in facsimile and with modern line drawings; these aids are as helpful here as they must have been for readers of the early medieval treatises in explaining the relationships within and among tetrachords and the mathematical divisions of the octave (and more). The incorporation of twentieth-century scholarship and recounting the piecing together of an understanding of the concepts transmitted in Isidore's *Etymologiae*, book III (and

working through apparent scribal errors) balances the density of material with an engaging story. Numerology and philosophical concepts are featured in the other two articles in the Numerus section, by Amnon Shiloah† who discusses the symbolic use of numbers in Arabic and Hebrew writings on music, and by Béatrice Bakhouché, whose chapter on the harmonic division of the world soul from Plato's *Timaeus* leads to a discussion on the impact of medieval glosses and other commentaries.

Essays on the 'Ars' theme follow Patrick Geary's keynote, a paper that leads the reader out of the mathematical sphere and towards liturgy and music as a performance tradition. David Ganz and Mariken Teeuwen explore Carolingian texts about the liberal arts and the use of glosses and commentaries by medieval scholars in the writings of earlier theorists, and John J. Contreni wrestles with interpretations of a passage in Charlemagne's *Admonitio generalis* that deals with the clerical education system of Carolingian institutions. Moving closer to musical practice, Marie-Noël Colette provides a survey of sources containing the earliest examples of French notations in the Bibliothèque nationale de France in Paris.

The section dedicated to the last conference theme, 'Cultus', brings readers to the practical applications of the writings on music that have dominated over half of this volume, with essays on the texts and melodies of the liturgy and a closing keynote essay by Calvin M. Bower. Susan Rankin and Felix Heinzer cover topics on Latin liturgical chant and poetry that intertwine textual interpretations with manuscript evidence and draw on contemporary accounts as a basis for deeper understanding of their relationships. Andreas Pfisterer explores the transmission of the responsories in Easter week in a number of liturgical centres, and Rebecca Maloy elucidates the creativity of the Carolingians by comparing textual and melodic variants in offertory chants.

The individual chapters are well referenced with (sometimes quite lengthy) footnotes, and the book as a whole contains a significant 'Works Cited' list with a healthy page-count (pp. 393-432). Although an eBook is available for purchase, one can imagine how interdisciplinary scholarship for this topic could be enriched with Open Access and searchability even just within the thirty-nine pages dedicated to lists of 'Collected Editions' (a quarter of a page), 'Editions of Early Collected or Anonymous Sources' (2 pp.), 'Editions of Early Writings by Known Individual Authors' (7 pp.), and 'Works of Modern Scholarship' (31 pp.). Perhaps someone will enter these into a Zotero archive.

As a book to honor the legacy of Charles Atkinson, the 'Bio-Bibliography' (pp. 373-91) is a fitting tribute. Any reader unfamiliar with Atkinson's impact on the study and teaching of early medieval music should be impressed by the eighteen-page list of his publications, presentations, performances, teaching, service to the profession, and more. On par with the contents of the book and the dedicatee's record of research achievement is its appealing cover. The stunning cover image, with its rich hues of burgundy, green, and blue with gold decoration, is from *Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, clm 14000, f. 46r* and shows St. Mark

in contemplation, perhaps resembling scholars and writers old and new in their pursuit of recording and transmitting the knowledge of their time. The full-colour plates within the volume provide significant enhancements; in particular, the corresponding image to that of the cover, on pp. 66–7, *Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, clm 14000*, ff. 5v–6r, shows King Solomon reigning over the hosts of angels, looking to the Lamb who is being adored by Elders on the opposite page. Additional full-colour images include:

- pp. 10–1: conference group and portrait photograph of Charles Atkinson;
- p. 93: *Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, ms. Vitr. 14-3*, f. 26v, showing diagrams that demonstrate the mathematical proportions of tetrachords and the division of the octave;
- p. 110: *Ghent, University Library, ms. 92*, f. 222r, showing nested lambda diagrams in the *Liber floridus*;
- p. 112: *Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional, ms. Vitr. 14-3*, f. 27r, showing a lambdoid diagram interpolated into Isidore's *Etymologiae*, book, III;
- p. 163: *Turin, Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria di Torino, ms. D.V.38*, f. 50r, containing a diagram of two nested lambdoid figures;
- pp. 164–5: *Rome, Biblioteca Vallicelliana, ms. C. 54*, ff. 194v–5r, with Calcidian figures appearing in a copy of Macrobius's *Commentary on the Dream of Scipio*.

This volume, in its rich interdisciplinarity—that is, ‘metadisciplinarity’—tied together through *musica* in its many senses, extends and broadens the discussion of classical and early medieval musical treatises and their theoretical concepts surrounding the modal system of the ninth century that are the focus of Atkinson's award-winning book, *The Critical Nexus: Tone-System, Mode, and Notation in Early Medieval Music* (Oxford, 2009). This continued engagement by such an impressive list of authors both invites further exploration and challenges readers of *Music in the Carolingian World: Witnesses to a Metadiscipline* to consider broader implications of the role of music in early medieval scholarship.

Debra Lacoste is Project Manager for the Digital Analysis of Chant Transmission (DACT) at Dalhousie University in Halifax, Nova Scotia, Canada. She has been Project Manager of the Cantus Database, currently funded through DACT, for over 25 years, and she also oversees Cantus Index. Her publications include 5 co-authored, authored, and edited books; over 20 authored and edited journal articles; 26 Cantus Database inventories (plus many more as editor or advisor); and 13 user manuals. Lacoste teaches trumpet studio at The University of Waterloo and is the Director and General Editor of the publishing company, The Institute of Mediaeval Music.